

AMENDED IN SENATE JUNE 28, 2009

AMENDED IN SENATE JUNE 16, 2009

CALIFORNIA LEGISLATURE—2009—10 REGULAR SESSION

ASSEMBLY BILL

No. 316

Introduced by Assembly Member Solorio
(Coauthor: Senator Leno)

February 18, 2009

An act to amend Section 340.6 of the Code of Civil Procedure, and to amend Sections 851.8, 4901, 4903, and 4904 of, and to add Section 851.86 to, the Penal Code, relating to wrongful convictions.

LEGISLATIVE COUNSEL'S DIGEST

AB 316, as amended, Solorio. Wrongful convictions.

Existing law requires that an action against an attorney for a wrongful act or omission, other than for actual fraud, arising in the performance of professional services must be commenced within one year after the plaintiff discovers, or should have discovered, the wrongful act or omission, or 4 years from the date of the wrongful act or omission, whichever occurs first.

This bill would provide that, if the plaintiff is required to establish his or her factual innocence for an underlying criminal charge as an element of his or her claim against an attorney, the time period to commence this action shall be 2 years after the plaintiff achieves postconviction exoneration in the form of a final judicial disposition of the criminal case.

Existing law provides that any finding that an arrestee is factually innocent, as specified, shall not be admissible as evidence in any action.

This bill would provide that, notwithstanding this provision, a finding that an arrestee is factually innocent shall be admissible as evidence at a hearing before the California Victim Compensation and Government Claims Board.

Existing law allows a presiding judge, whenever a person is acquitted of a charge and it appears to the judge that the defendant is factually innocent of the charge, to order that the records in the case be sealed.

This bill would require a judge, upon written or oral motion of any party in the case or the court, to order that the records in a case be sealed whenever a person is convicted of a charge and the conviction is set aside because a determination was made that the person was factually innocent.

Existing law allows a person erroneously convicted and imprisoned to present a claim within a period of 6 months after judgment of acquittal or discharge given, or after pardon granted, or after release from imprisonment, against the state to the California Victim Compensation and Government Claims Board for the pecuniary injury sustained by him or her through the erroneous conviction and imprisonment.

This bill would instead provide that a person erroneously convicted and imprisoned may present this claim within 2 years.

Existing law establishes a process for a hearing on an erroneously convicted person's claim at which the claimant is required to introduce evidence in support of the claim and the Attorney General may introduce evidence in opposition. Existing law requires the claimant to prove the facts set forth in the statement constituting the claim, including that the crime charged was either not committed at all, or, if committed, not committed by the claimant, and the fact that the claimant did not, by any act or omission, either intentionally or negligently, contribute to the bringing about of his or her arrest or conviction, and that he or she sustained pecuniary injury. If the evidence shows that the claimant has proved these facts, existing law requires the board to recommend to the Legislature that an appropriation be made for indemnifying the claimant.

This bill would remove the requirement on the claimant to prove that he or she did not negligently contribute to his or her arrest or conviction. The bill would provide that when determining whether the claimant intentionally contributed to the bringing about of his or her arrest or conviction, the factfinder shall not consider statements obtained from an involuntary false confession or involuntary plea. The bill would provide that the claimant shall ~~bare~~ bear the burden of proving by a

preponderance of the evidence that the statements were obtained from an involuntary false confession or involuntary plea.

Vote: majority. Appropriation: no. Fiscal committee: yes.

State-mandated local program: no.

The people of the State of California do enact as follows:

1 SECTION 1. The Legislature finds and declares all the
2 following:

3 (a) It is the intent of the Legislature to remedy some of the harm
4 caused to all factually innocent people who have been wrongfully
5 convicted and served time in state prison in California.

6 (b) A factually innocent person is a person who was convicted
7 of a crime that either was not committed or, if committed, was not
8 committed by him or her.

9 (c) This act would remove some of the obstacles to
10 compensation for the factually innocent and would ease their
11 transition back into society.

12 SEC. 2. Section 340.6 of the Code of Civil Procedure is
13 amended to read:

14 340.6. (a) An action against an attorney for a wrongful act or
15 omission, other than for actual fraud, arising in the performance
16 of professional services shall be commenced within one year after
17 the plaintiff discovers, or through the use of reasonable diligence
18 should have discovered, the facts constituting the wrongful act or
19 omission, or four years from the date of the wrongful act or
20 omission, whichever occurs first. If the plaintiff is required to
21 establish his or her factual innocence for an underlying criminal
22 charge as an element of his or her claim, the action shall be
23 commenced within two years after the plaintiff achieves
24 postconviction exoneration in the form of a final judicial
25 disposition of the criminal case. ~~Except as regards claims requiring~~
26 ~~the plaintiff to establish his or her factual innocence, in~~ *Except for*
27 *a claim for which the plaintiff is required to establish his or her*
28 *factual innocence, in* no event shall the time for commencement
29 of legal action exceed four years except that the period shall be
30 tolled during the time that any of the following exist:

31 (1) The plaintiff has not sustained actual injury.

1 (2) The attorney continues to represent the plaintiff regarding
2 the specific subject matter in which the alleged wrongful act or
3 omission occurred.

4 (3) The attorney willfully conceals the facts constituting the
5 wrongful act or omission when such facts are known to the
6 attorney, except that this subdivision shall toll only the four-year
7 limitation.

8 (4) The plaintiff is under a legal or physical disability which
9 restricts the plaintiff's ability to commence legal action.

10 (b) In an action based upon an instrument in writing, the
11 effective date of which depends upon some act or event of the
12 future, the period of limitations provided for by this section shall
13 commence to run upon the occurrence of that act or event.

14 SEC. 3. Section 851.8 of the Penal Code is amended to read:

15 851.8. (a) In any case where a person has been arrested and
16 no accusatory pleading has been filed, the person arrested may
17 petition the law enforcement agency having jurisdiction over the
18 offense to destroy its records of the arrest. A copy of the petition
19 shall be served upon the prosecuting attorney of the county or city
20 having jurisdiction over the offense. The law enforcement agency
21 having jurisdiction over the offense, upon a determination that the
22 person arrested is factually innocent, shall, with the concurrence
23 of the prosecuting attorney, seal its arrest records, and the petition
24 for relief under this section for three years from the date of the
25 arrest and thereafter destroy its arrest records and the petition. The
26 law enforcement agency having jurisdiction over the offense shall
27 notify the Department of Justice, and any law enforcement agency
28 that arrested the petitioner or participated in the arrest of the
29 petitioner for an offense for which the petitioner has been found
30 factually innocent under this subdivision, of the sealing of the
31 arrest records and the reason therefor. The Department of Justice
32 and any law enforcement agency so notified shall forthwith seal
33 their records of the arrest and the notice of sealing for three years
34 from the date of the arrest, and thereafter destroy their records of
35 the arrest and the notice of sealing. The law enforcement agency
36 having jurisdiction over the offense and the Department of Justice
37 shall request the destruction of any records of the arrest which they
38 have given to any local, state, or federal agency or to any other
39 person or entity. Each agency, person, or entity within the State

1 of California receiving the request shall destroy its records of the
2 arrest and the request, unless otherwise provided in this section.

3 (b) If, after receipt by both the law enforcement agency and the
4 prosecuting attorney of a petition for relief under subdivision (a),
5 the law enforcement agency and prosecuting attorney do not
6 respond to the petition by accepting or denying the petition within
7 60 days after the running of the relevant statute of limitations or
8 within 60 days after receipt of the petition in cases where the statute
9 of limitations has previously lapsed, then the petition shall be
10 deemed to be denied. In any case where the petition of an arrestee
11 to the law enforcement agency to have an arrest record destroyed
12 is denied, petition may be made to the superior court that would
13 have had territorial jurisdiction over the matter. A copy of the
14 petition shall be served on the law enforcement agency and the
15 prosecuting attorney of the county or city having jurisdiction over
16 the offense at least 10 days prior to the hearing thereon. The
17 prosecuting attorney and the law enforcement agency through the
18 district attorney may present evidence to the court at the hearing.
19 Notwithstanding Section 1538.5 or 1539, any judicial determination
20 of factual innocence made pursuant to this section may be heard
21 and determined upon declarations, affidavits, police reports, or
22 any other evidence submitted by the parties which is material,
23 relevant and reliable. A finding of factual innocence and an order
24 for the sealing and destruction of records pursuant to this section
25 shall not be made unless the court finds that no reasonable cause
26 exists to believe that the arrestee committed the offense for which
27 the arrest was made. In any court hearing to determine the factual
28 innocence of a party, the initial burden of proof shall rest with the
29 petitioner to show that no reasonable cause exists to believe that
30 the arrestee committed the offense for which the arrest was made.
31 If the court finds that this showing of no reasonable cause has been
32 made by the petitioner, then the burden of proof shall shift to the
33 respondent to show that a reasonable cause exists to believe that
34 the petitioner committed the offense for which the arrest was made.
35 If the court finds the arrestee to be factually innocent of the charges
36 for which the arrest was made, then the court shall order the law
37 enforcement agency having jurisdiction over the offense, the
38 Department of Justice, and any law enforcement agency which
39 arrested the petitioner or participated in the arrest of the petitioner
40 for an offense for which the petitioner has been found factually

1 innocent under this section to seal their records of the arrest and
2 the court order to seal and destroy the records, for three years from
3 the date of the arrest and thereafter to destroy their records of the
4 arrest and the court order to seal and destroy such records. The
5 court shall also order the law enforcement agency having
6 jurisdiction over the offense and the Department of Justice to
7 request the destruction of any records of the arrest which they have
8 given to any local, state, or federal agency, person or entity. Each
9 state or local agency, person or entity within the State of California
10 receiving such a request shall destroy its records of the arrest and
11 the request to destroy the records, unless otherwise provided in
12 this section. The court shall give to the petitioner a copy of any
13 court order concerning the destruction of the arrest records.

14 (c) In any case where a person has been arrested, and an
15 accusatory pleading has been filed, but where no conviction has
16 occurred, the defendant may, at any time after dismissal of the
17 action, petition the court that dismissed the action for a finding
18 that the defendant is factually innocent of the charges for which
19 the arrest was made. A copy of the petition shall be served on the
20 prosecuting attorney of the county or city in which the accusatory
21 pleading was filed at least 10 days prior to the hearing on the
22 petitioner's factual innocence. The prosecuting attorney may
23 present evidence to the court at the hearing. The hearing shall be
24 conducted as provided in subdivision (b). If the court finds the
25 petitioner to be factually innocent of the charges for which the
26 arrest was made, then the court shall grant the relief as provided
27 in subdivision (b).

28 (d) In any case where a person has been arrested and an
29 accusatory pleading has been filed, but where no conviction has
30 occurred, the court may, with the concurrence of the prosecuting
31 attorney, grant the relief provided in subdivision (b) at the time of
32 the dismissal of the accusatory pleading.

33 (e) Whenever any person is acquitted of a charge and it appears
34 to the judge presiding at the trial at which the acquittal occurred
35 that the defendant was factually innocent of the charge, the judge
36 may grant the relief provided in subdivision (b).

37 (f) In any case where a person who has been arrested is granted
38 relief pursuant to subdivision (a) or (b), the law enforcement agency
39 having jurisdiction over the offense or court shall issue a written
40 declaration to the arrestee stating that it is the determination of the

1 law enforcement agency having jurisdiction over the offense or
2 court that the arrestee is factually innocent of the charges for which
3 the person was arrested and that the arrestee is thereby exonerated.
4 Thereafter, the arrest shall be deemed not to have occurred and
5 the person may answer accordingly any question relating to its
6 occurrence.

7 (g) The Department of Justice shall furnish forms to be utilized
8 by persons applying for the destruction of their arrest records and
9 for the written declaration that one person was found factually
10 innocent under subdivisions (a) and (b).

11 (h) Documentation of arrest records destroyed pursuant to
12 subdivision (a), (b), (c), (d), or (e) that are contained in
13 investigative police reports shall bear the notation "Exonerated"
14 whenever reference is made to the arrestee. The arrestee shall be
15 notified in writing by the law enforcement agency having
16 jurisdiction over the offense of the sealing and destruction of the
17 arrest records pursuant to this section.

18 (i) (1) Any finding that an arrestee is factually innocent pursuant
19 to subdivision (a), (b), (c), (d), or (e) shall not be admissible as
20 evidence in any action.

21 (2) Notwithstanding paragraph (1), a finding that an arrestee is
22 factually innocent pursuant to subdivisions (a) to (e), inclusive,
23 shall be admissible as evidence at a hearing before the California
24 Victim Compensation and Government Claims Board.

25 (j) Destruction of records of arrest pursuant to subdivision (a),
26 (b), (c), (d), or (e) shall be accomplished by permanent obliteration
27 of all entries or notations upon the records pertaining to the arrest,
28 and the record shall be prepared again so that it appears that the
29 arrest never occurred. However, where (1) the only entries on the
30 record pertain to the arrest and (2) the record can be destroyed
31 without necessarily affecting the destruction of other records, then
32 the document constituting the record shall be physically destroyed.

33 (k) No records shall be destroyed pursuant to subdivision (a),
34 (b), (c), (d), or (e) if the arrestee or a codefendant has filed a civil
35 action against the peace officers or law enforcement jurisdiction
36 which made the arrest or instituted the prosecution and if the
37 agency which is the custodian of the records has received a certified
38 copy of the complaint in the civil action, until the civil action has
39 been resolved. Any records sealed pursuant to this section by the
40 court in the civil actions, upon a showing of good cause, may be

opened and submitted into evidence. The records shall be confidential and shall be available for inspection only by the court, jury, parties, counsel for the parties and any other person authorized by the court. Immediately following the final resolution of the civil action, records subject to subdivision (a), (b), (c), (d), or (e) shall be sealed and destroyed pursuant to subdivision (a), (b), (c), (d), or (e).

(l) For arrests occurring on or after January 1, 1981, and for accusatory pleadings filed on or after January 1, 1981, petitions for relief under this section may be filed up to two years from the date of the arrest or filing of the accusatory pleading, whichever is later. Until January 1, 1983, petitioners can file for relief under this section for arrests which occurred or accusatory pleadings which were filed up to five years prior to the effective date of the statute. Any time restrictions on filing for relief under this section may be waived upon a showing of good cause by the petitioner and in the absence of prejudice.

(m) Any relief which is available to a petitioner under this section for an arrest shall also be available for an arrest which has been deemed to be or described as a detention under Section 849.5 or 851.6.

(n) This section shall not apply to any offense which is classified as an infraction.

(o) (1) This section shall be repealed on the effective date of a final judgment based on a claim under the California or United States Constitution holding that evidence that is relevant, reliable, and material may not be considered for purposes of a judicial determination of factual innocence under this section. For purposes of this subdivision, a judgment by the appellate division of a superior court is a final judgment if it is published and if it is not reviewed on appeal by a court of appeal. A judgment of a court of appeal is a final judgment if it is published and if it is not reviewed by the California Supreme Court.

(2) Any decision referred to in this subdivision shall be stayed pending appeal.

(3) If not otherwise appealed by a party to the action, any decision referred to in this subdivision which is a judgment by the appellate division of the superior court shall be appealed by the Attorney General.

1 (p) A judgment of the court under subdivision (b), (c), (d), or
2 (e) is subject to the following appeal path:

3 (1) In a felony case, appeal is to the court of appeal.

4 (2) In a misdemeanor case, or in a case in which no accusatory
5 pleading was filed, appeal is to the appellate division of the superior
6 court.

7 SEC. 4. Section 851.86 is added to the Penal Code, to read:

8 851.86. Whenever a person is convicted of a charge, and the
9 conviction is set aside based upon a determination that the person
10 was factually innocent of the charge, the judge shall order that the
11 records in the case be sealed, including any record of arrest or
12 detention, upon written or oral motion of any party in the case or
13 the court, and with notice to all parties to the case. If such an order
14 is made, the court shall give the defendant a copy of that order and
15 inform the defendant that he or she may thereafter state he or she
16 was not arrested for that charge and that he or she was not
17 convicted of that charge, and that he or she was found innocent of
18 that charge by the court. The court shall also inform the defendant
19 of the availability of indemnity for persons erroneously convicted
20 pursuant to Chapter 5 (commencing with Section 4900) of Title 6
21 of Part 3, and the time limitations for presenting those claims.

22 SEC. 5. Section 4901 of the Penal Code is amended to read:

23 4901. A claim under Section 4900, accompanied by a statement
24 of the facts constituting the claim, verified in the manner provided
25 for the verification of complaints in civil actions, must be presented
26 by the claimant to the California Victim Compensation and
27 Government Claims Board within a period of two years after
28 judgment of acquittal or discharge given, or after pardon granted,
29 or after release from imprisonment, and no claim not so presented
30 shall be considered by the California Victim Compensation and
31 Government Claims Board.

32 SEC. 6. Section 4903 of the Penal Code is amended to read:

33 4903. On such hearing the claimant shall introduce evidence
34 in support of the claim, and the Attorney General may introduce
35 evidence in opposition thereto. The claimant must prove the facts
36 set forth in the statement constituting the claim, including the fact
37 that the crime with which he or she was charged was either not
38 committed at all, or, if committed, was not committed by him or
39 her, the fact that he or she did not, by any act or omission on his
40 or her part, intentionally contribute to the bringing about of his or

1 her arrest or conviction for the crime with which he or she was
2 charged, and the pecuniary injury sustained by him or her through
3 his or her erroneous conviction and imprisonment. For purposes
4 of this chapter, when determining whether the claimant
5 intentionally contributed to the bringing about of his or her arrest
6 or conviction, the factfinder shall not consider statements obtained
7 from an involuntary false confession or involuntary plea. The
8 claimant shall ~~bare~~ bear the burden of proving by a preponderance
9 of the evidence that the statements were obtained from an
10 involuntary false confession or involuntary plea.

11 SEC. 7. Section 4904 of the Penal Code is amended to read:

12 4904. If the evidence shows that the crime with which the
13 claimant was charged was either not committed at all, or, if
14 committed, was not committed by the claimant, and that the
15 claimant did not, by any act or omission, intentionally contribute
16 to the bringing about of his or her arrest or conviction for the crime
17 with which he or she was charged, and that the claimant has
18 sustained pecuniary injury through his or her erroneous conviction
19 and imprisonment, the California Victim Compensation and
20 Government Claims Board shall report the facts of the case and
21 its conclusions to the next Legislature, with a recommendation
22 that an appropriation be made by the Legislature for the purpose
23 of indemnifying the claimant for the pecuniary injury. The amount
24 of the appropriation recommended shall be a sum equivalent to
25 one hundred dollars (\$100) per day of incarceration served
26 subsequent to the claimant's conviction and that appropriation
27 shall not be treated as gross income to the recipient under the
28 Revenue and Taxation Code.